## रक्षा लेखा महानियंत्रक Controller General of Defence Accounts उलन बटार मार्ग, पालम,दिल्ली छावनी-110010 Ulan Batar Road, Palam, Delhi Cantt 110010

No. AN/XIII/13006/2A/Vol. XXI

Dated:

31.07.2017

To,

All PCDA/PIFA All CDA /IFA

Subject:

Departmental Inquiries: Guidelines to the Inquiring Authority.

Reference:

HQrs Office Circulars bearing No. even dated 17.04.2014 and 27.05.2016.

While processing disciplinary and appeal cases in HQrs Office it has been observed that the Inquiry report in some cases contains some technical/procedural infirmities, thereby resulting in remitting the case back for further inquiry from certain stage to remove the said infirmities.

- 2. Attention is invited to HQrs Office Circulars cited under reference (copy enclosed) containing guidelines for Inquiring Authority. The guidelines are only illustrative and not exhaustive. However, provisions under Rule 14 of the CCS (CCA) Rules are absolute and every IO/PO must assimilate these provisions before starting inquiry proceedings. Further, it may be kept in view that the role of Presenting Officer is to present the case /evidence effectively before the IO on behalf of the Disciplinary Authority. PO, in any case, should not indulge himself in becoming judgmental during course of Inquiry Proceedings.
- 3. It is requested that a copy of the above guidelines may invariably be provided to the Inquiring Authority as and when appointed, to avoid technical/procedural infirmity in departmental proceedings. Further, they may access a Handbook prepared by ISTM/DOPT for Inquiry Officers and Disciplinary authority available at DOPT site under Reports tab. They may also be directed to strictly adhere to procedure laid down in the CCS (CC&A) Rules, 1965 and other Government instruction/guidelines issued on the subject.

(Kavita Garg) Sr. Dy. CGDA (Admin)

## रक्षा लेखा विभाग रक्षा मंत्रालय भारत सरकार



#### DEFENCE ACCOUNTS DEPARTMENT MINISTRY OF DEFENCE GOVERNMENT OF INDIA

Through CGDA's Website

No. AN/XIII/13006/2A/VOL.XXI

Dated: 27<sup>th</sup> May 2016

To

All Principal Controllers/ Principal IFAs All Controllers/ IFAs

Subject: Departmental Inquiries – Guidelines for the Inquiry Officers (IOs).

The undersigned is directed to state that guidelines for the Inquiry Officers had been issued by this HQrs. Office from time to time in the matter of conducting Departmental Inquiries. However, infirmities have been observed in a large number of inquiries. Any infirmity in the conduct of Departmental Inquiries may lead to adverse orders from Courts of Law. Hence, it is imperative on the part of Inquiry Officers conducting Departmental Inquiries that due process of law as laid down in Central Civil Services (Classification, Control and Appeal) Rules, 1965 is followed by them. To facilitate the Inquiry Officers, an Annexure containing do's and don'ts is appended to this letter which may guide them in Departmental Inquiries. It may kindly be noted that these guidelines are illustrative and not exhaustive. In case of doubt, relevant provisions of the Central Civil Services (Classification, Control and Appeal) Rules, 1965 read with Government of India's orders issued thereon from time to time may be referred to. Any suggestions for improvement of these guidelines are welcome.

Encl.: As above.

(S.K. SHARMA) For C.G.D.A.

Phone: 011-25665565 Email: <u>sushilsharma.dad@gov.in</u>

रक्षा लेखा महानियंत्रक CONTROLLER GENERAL OF DEFENCE ACCOUNTS उलन बटार रोड़, पालम Ulan Batar Road, Palam दिल्ली छावनी–110010 Delhi Cantt-110010

#### → Receipt of documents

- See that the following documents are received from the Disciplinary Authority –
  - Appointment order of the Inquiry Officer (IO) issued by the Disciplinary Authority
  - Memorandum of charges containing Annexure I to IV with copies of the documents listed in Annexure III and statements of witnesses, if any, listed in Annexure IV
  - Proof in support of having served the Memorandum of charges on the Charged Officer (CO)
  - A copy of the written statement of defence, if any, submitted by the CO
  - A copy of the order appointing the "Presenting Officer" (PO)

[Rule 14(6)]

### → Notice for Preliminary Hearing

- Issue notice to the PO and CO, through respective Controlling Officers, for preliminary hearing.
- Ensure service of the notices on the PO and CO.
- Ensure that preliminary hearing is held within ten days from the date of receipt of order of appointment as IO.

[Rule 14(7)]

### → <u>Defence Assistance</u>

- Allow the CO to take assistance of a serving or retired Government servant
- Allow the CO to take assistance of a legal practitioner in the following conditions –
  - The PO is a legal practitioner, Prosecuting Officer of CBI or a Government Law Officer (such as Legal Adviser, Junior Legal Adviser)
  - The Disciplinary Authority, having regard to the circumstances of the case, so permits
- Record the reasons in writing for rejecting the request of CO for defence assistance

[Rule 14(8)]

## → <u>Preliminary Hearing</u>

- On the date of Preliminary Hearing, ascertain from the CO
  - Whether he has received Memorandum of Charges
  - If so, whether he has understood the charges
  - Whether he pleads guilty or has any defence to make
- If the CO pleads guilty of all the articles of charge
  - Record the plea, sign the record and obtain signatures of the CO

1

- Return the record to the Disciplinary Authority with findings of guilt
- If the CO pleads guilty to some of the articles of charge
  - Record the plea in respect of such articles of charge to which the CO has pleaded guilty, sign the record and obtain signatures of the CO
  - Return a finding of guilt in respect of those articles of charge to which the CO pleads guilty
- If the CO pleads not guilty to some or all the articles of charge
  - Direct the PO to produce the evidence by which he proposes to prove the articles of charge
  - Direct the CO to
    - ✓ Inspect the documents listed in Annexure III of the Memorandum of Charges within five days of the order
    - ✓ Submit a list of additional documents which may be in possession of the office but are not mentioned in Annexure III of Memorandum of Charges and duly explaining their relevancy, within ten days of the order
    - ✓ Submit a list of witnesses to be examined on his behalf
- Adjourn the case to a later date not exceeding thirty days

[Rule 14(9)(10)(11)]

## → Production of additional documents

- On receipt of the list of additional documents from the CO, satisfy about their relevancy
- Refuse the documents not considered relevant to the articles of charge duly recording the reasons for such refusal
- forward the list of documents considered relevant to the authority under whose custody the additional documents are held, for their production by a specified date
- Watch for an intimation from the authority about inspection of the additional documents having been given to the CO
- Watch for an intimation from the authority with reasons for refusal to give inspection of the additional documents to the CO.

[Rule 14(12)(13)]

# → Regular Hearing – Presentation of the case of the Disciplinary Authority

- Production of prosecution documents and examination of prosecution witnesses
  - On the date fixed for regular hearing, direct the PO to produce the documentary evidence
  - Take on record the documentary evidence as 'Prosecution Exhibits'
  - Direct the PO to examine Prosecution Witnesses, if any [Examination-in-Chief]
  - Give an opportunity to the CO/ his defence assistant to cross-examine the Prosecution Witnesses [Cross-Examination]

3

- Give an opportunity to the PO to re-examine the Prosecution Witnesses on any point on which they have been cross-examined, if requested, but not on any new point [Re-Examination]
- Question the Prosecution Witnesses, if considered necessary
- Make a record of deposition of the witnesses
- Ensure that Cross-Examination of a witness follows its Examination-in-Chief and the same is not postponed till Examination-in-Chief of all witnesses is over

[Rule 14(14)]

## → Regular Hearing – Production of new evidence

- In the interest of justice, the IO by reasons to be recorded in writing, may
  - Allow the PO to produce new evidence not included in the Memorandum of Charges
  - Call for new evidence
  - Call new witnesses not included in the Memorandum of Charges
  - Allow the CO to produce new evidence
- Give an opportunity to the CO to inspect the documents proposed to be introduced as further evidence
- Adjourn the inquiry for three clear days exclusive of day of adjournment and the day to which it is adjourned
- Allow adducing of new evidence only if there is an inherent lacuna in the evidence produced and not for filing up the gaps in the evidence

[Rule 14(15)]

## → Regular Hearing – Statement of Defence of the CO

- After closure of the case of the disciplinary authority, ask the CO to state his defence either orally or in writing
- If the CO states his defence orally, record it and get it signed by the CO
- If the CO states his defence in writing, give a copy of the same to the PO

[Rule 14(16)]

## → Regular Hearing – Presentation of the case of the CO

- Direct the CO to present his defence by producing evidence
- Take the same on record as 'Defence Exhibits'
- Allow the CO to examine himself on his own behalf, if the CO so desires
- Direct the CO to examine Defence Witnesses, if any
- Direct the PO to cross-examine the Defence Witnesses
- Make a record of deposition of the Defence Witnesses
- Allow the CO to re-examine the Defence Witnesses, if so desired
- Examine the Defence Witnesses, if considered necessary

[Rule 14(17)]

## → Regular Hearing – General Examination of the CO by the IO

 After close of the case of the CO, if the CO does not offer himself to be examined as his own witness, generally question the CO on the circumstances appearing against him in the evidence to enable him to clear his position

Mandatorily do the General Examination and record the same

[Rule 14(18)]

## → Regular Hearing - Summing up of Arguments or filing of written briefs

- After completion of production of evidence, hear the PO and the CO, to sum up their cases
- Direct the PO and the CO on his own or permit the PO and the CO to submit their written briefs, if they so desire
- Make available a copy of the written brief of the PO to the CO
- Direct the CO to submit his written brief on receipt of the PO's written brief
   [Rule 14(19)]

#### → Ex-parte Inquiry

- Hold ex-parte inquiry in the following circumstances
  - The CO does not submit written statement of defence on or before the date specified for the purpose even after receipt of Memorandum of Charges
  - The CO does not appear in person before the IO
  - The CO fails to or refuses to comply with orders of the IO
  - The CO attends part of the hearings and remains absent for rest of the hearings
- Hold the Ex-parte inquiry strictly adhering to the procedure laid down under Rule 14(11) to (20)
- Ensure that notices for hearings and the copies of the proceedings are invariably sent to the IO

[Rule 14(20)]

#### → Change of the IO

- If for any reason, the IO is changed during the course of inquiry, the successor IO shall proceed from the stage from which the predecessor left
- In the interest of justice, the succeeding IO may take the following action in respect of witnesses whose evidence has already been recorded
  - Recall the witnesses
  - Examine the witnesses
  - Cross-examine the witnesses
  - Re-examine the witnesses

[Rule 14(22)]

## → <u>Inquiry Report</u>

- At the close of the inquiry, prepare a report in writing containing the following –
  - Reference to the order of appointment of the IO
  - The articles of charge indicating and statement of the imputation of misconduct or misbehaviour, indicating those which are admitted and which require discussion
  - Each article of charge inquired into
  - The case in support of each article of charge inquired into
  - The defence of the CO in respect of each article of charge inquired into
  - An assessment of the evidence adduced during the inquiry in respect of each article of charge inquired into
  - Reasoned findings on each article of charge inquired into
- Clearly state whether or not the charges can be held to have been proved against the CO i.e. proved or not proved
- The conclusions in the Inquiry Report must flow logically out of the evidence on record
- The findings must be in conformity with the charges
- Avoid merely summarizing the version of the two sides and selecting one version
- Avoid irrelevant considerations, conjectures, surmises, suspicion etc. in the Inquiry Report
- Avoid reference to the proceedings happened before and after the inquiry
- Avoid giving weight, whatsoever to his personal knowledge of the matter against the IO
- Avoid giving recommendations either to impose a stringent penalty, or to take a lenient view, or for imposing a specific penalty
- Forward the Inquiry Report duly signed to the Disciplinary Authority along with the following folders —
  - Folder I : Memorandum of Charges with Annexures I to IV
  - Folder II : Proof of receipt of Memorandum of Charges by the CO
  - Folder III : Written statement of defence of the CO
  - Folder IV : Orders of the Disciplinary Authority appointing the IO and the PO
  - Folder V : Daily Order sheets
  - Folder VI : Prosecution Exhibits
  - Folder VII: Depositions of the Prosecution Witnesses and their examination and cross examination etc.
  - Folder VIII : Defence Exhibits
  - Folder IX: Depositions of the Prosecution Witnesses and their examination and cross examination etc.
  - Folder X : Correspondence made in connection with the inquiry with the CO and the Disciplinary Authority; orders made by the

#### Confidential Important Circular

Dated: 17.04.2014

## रक्षा लेखा महानियंत्रक Controller General of Defence Accounts

उलन बटार मार्ग, पालम,दिल्ली छन्,जी-110010 Ulan Batar Road, Palam, Delhi Cantt 110010

No. AN/XIII/13006/2A/Vol. XXI

To,

All CDA/PIFA

Subject: Departmental Inquiries: Guidelines to the Inquiry Officers (IOs).

Of late it has been observed that the Inquiry report submitted by various Inquiry Officer in many cases contain certain procedural infirmities, thereby resulting in remitting back the cases to the Inquiry officer (IO) for further inquiry by the appropriate Authority. Further, in some cases inquiries have been delayed for want of clarification on the one or another issues relating to departmental proceedings.

- 2. Accordingly, to facilitate the timely completion of disciplinary proceedings as per CVC guidelines without any procedural infirmities, guidelines issued by Govt. from time to time have been summarized in the form of "Guidelines/Tips to IOs" in the enclosed Annexure. These guidelines are only illustrative and not exhaustive in nature.
- 3. It is requested that a copy of the above guidelines may invariably be provided to the Inquiry Officers as and when appointed, to avoid infirmity / procedural lacunae in departmental proceedings at any stage. They may also be directed to strictly adhere to procedure laid down in the CCS (CC&A) Rules, 1965 and other Government instruction/guidelines issued on the subject.

Receipt of this circular with its enclosures may be acknowledged.

RK Kasna (R K Karna) Jt. CGDA (Admin)

# No. AN/XIII/13006/2A/Vol. XXI Dated: 17.04.2014 Annexure

#### Departmental Inquiries: Some important tips / Guidelines to the Inquiry Officers

- i. The procedure laid down in Rule 14 of the CCS (CC&A) Rules, 1965 and GOI instruction below therein may strictly be adhered to avoid any infirmity in departmental inquiry at any stage.
- ii. For each day proceedings a separate Daily Order sheet for recording the business transacted on that day should be maintained.
- iii. Requests made by the CO either orally or in writing i.e. through representations and the decisions taken, or, rulings given by you thereon, shall be recorded in the Daily Order sheet.
- iv. Depositions made by the Prosecution or Defence Witnesses and their examination/cross-examination, are to be recorded in a separate sheet and enclosed to the Daily Order sheet.
- v. The Daily Order Sheet, has to be signed by the IO and also by all those who are present on that day i.e. the Presenting Officer, the Charged Officer and his Defence Assistant.
- vi. It is advisable to have the Daily Order sheet prepared in quadruplicate. One copy of each of the Daily Order sheet has to be handed over to the CO and PO on conclusion of the day's proceedings. One copy has to be sent to the Disciplinary Authority. The fourth copy is required to be enclosed to the Inquiry report.
- vii. The Inquiry may be stayed under the following circumstances.
  - a) Under the specific orders/directions of the CAT or Court.
  - b) Under specific written directions and the instructions of the Disciplinary Authority to this effect.
  - c) When an application for the change of the IO on the grounds of bias is moved by the Charged Official, till a final disposal of the application by a competent authority.
- viii. The Inquiry Officers are expected to be unbiased, fair, just and judicious. Therefore it is to be ensured that fair and reasonable opportunity may be given to both the parties viz. defence and prosecution.
  - ix. The findings of IO on each charge must be clear and specific without any ambiguity i.e. charge proved or not proved.

- w. While drafting the report, the relation between the imputations, evidence and conclusions ought to be clearly indicated. Your conclusions should be logical and on the basis of the assessment of evidence. Merely summarizing the version of the two sides and selecting one version is not be appropriate.
- **xi.** The findings must be in conformity with the misconduct with which the CO was charged in the Memorandum of Charges.
- **xii.** Recommendations either to impose a stringent penalty, or to take a lenient view, or for imposing a specific penalty may be avoided.
- xiii. The Inquiry report should contain:
  - (a) reference to the order appointing you as IO;
  - (b) articles of charge in brief, indicating those which are admitted and which require discussion;
  - (c) each charge inquired into;
  - (d) the case in support of each charge;
  - (e) the case of defence on each charge;
  - (f) assessment/analysis of evidence separately in respect of each charge;
  - (g) findings/conclusions separately in respect of each charge.
- xiv. The report will be accompanied by the following folders.
  - 1. Memorandum of Charges with Annexure I to IV.
  - 2. Proof of receipt of the Memorandum of charges by the CO.
  - 3. Written statement of defence of the CO.
  - 4. Orders of the Disciplinary Authority appointing the IO and PO.
  - 5. Daily Order sheets.
  - 6. Prosecution exhibits.
  - 7. Depositions of the Prosecution witnesses and their examination and cross- examination.
  - Defence exhibits.
  - 9. Depositions of the defence witnesses and their examination and cross-examination.
  - 10. Correspondence made with the (a) Charged Official viz. notices for hearings; (b) Disciplinary Authority; (c) copies of the representations moved by the CO during the inquiry and decisions taken by the IO thereon and (d) any other miscellaneous correspondence relevant to the inquiry.

- xv. Once a regular hearing in a departmental proceeding is started, such hearing should, as far as practicable, be continued on a day to day basis, unless in the opinion of the IO, for the reasons to be recorded in writing, an adjournment is unavoidable in the interest of justice.
- xvi. The IOs endeavour shall be to complete the inquiry within a period of six months from the date of receipt of order of his appointment as IO as stipulated by the Central Vigilance Commission. Where it is not possible to adhere to this time limit, the IO should submit reasons for delay to the disciplinary authority in writing.
- xvii. In case of doubt the Inquiry Officer may consult the procedure laid down under CCS (CC&A) Rules, 1965/Vigilance manual and other Government instruction/guidelines issued on the subject.